

No. 06-937

Title: Quanta Computer, Inc., et al., Petitioners  
v.  
LG Electronics, Inc.

Docketed: January 8, 2007

Lower Ct: United States Court of Appeals for the Federal Circuit

Case Nos.: (05-1261, 05-1262, 05-1263, 05-1264, 05-1302, 05-1303, 05-1304)

Decision Date: July 7, 2006

Rehearing Denied: September 1, 2006

[Questions Presented](#)

~~~Date~~~ ~~~~~Proceedings and Orders~~~~~

Nov 30 2006 Motion (06M54) of petitioner for leave to file a petition for a writ of certiorari under seal with redacted copies for the public record filed.

Nov 30 2006 Petition for a writ of certiorari filed. (Response due February 7, 2007)

Dec 6 2006 MOTION (06M54) DISTRIBUTED for Conference of January 5, 2007.

Jan 8 2007 Motion (06M54) of petitioner for leave to file a petition for a writ of certiorari under seal with redacted copies for the public record Granted.

Feb 1 2007 Order extending time to file response to petition to and including March 9, 2007.

Mar 9 2007 Brief amici curiae of Dell Inc., et al. filed.

Mar 9 2007 Brief of respondent LG Electronics, Inc. in opposition filed.

Mar 9 2007 Brief amicus curiae of Minebea Co., Ltd. filed.

Mar 20 2007 Reply of petitioners Quanta Computer, Inc., et al. filed.

Mar 21 2007 DISTRIBUTED for Conference of April 13, 2007.

Mar 27 2007 Letter of March 27, 2007, from counsel for petitioner received. (Distributed)

Apr 16 2007 The Solicitor General is invited to file a brief in this case expressing the views of the United States.

Aug 24 2007 Brief amicus curiae of United States filed.

Sep 4 2007 Supplemental brief of respondent LG Electronics, Inc. filed. (Distributed)

Sep 5 2007 DISTRIBUTED for Conference of September 24, 2007.

Sep 25 2007 Petition GRANTED. The brief of petitioners is to be filed with the Clerk and served upon opposing counsel on or before 2 p.m., Monday, November 5, 2007. The brief of respondent is to be filed with the Clerk and served upon opposing counsel on or before 2 p.m., Monday, December 3, 2007. A reply brief, if any, is to be filed with the Clerk and served upon opposing counsel on or before 2 p.m., Friday, December 28, 2007. Briefs of amici curiae are to be filed with the Clerk and served upon counsel for the parties on or before 2 p.m., 7 days after the brief for the party supported is filed, or if in support of neither party, within 7 days after the petitioners' brief is filed.

Oct 31 2007 Consent to the filing of amicus briefs in support of either party received from counsel for the petitioner.

Nov 1 2007 Consent to the filing of amicus curiae briefs in support of either or neither party received from counsel for the respondent.

Nov 5 2007 Joint appendix filed. Volume 1 (Pages 1 to 144). Statement of costs received.

Nov 5 2007 Brief of petitioners Quanta Computer, Inc., et al. filed.

Nov 5 2007 Motion for leave to file Volume II of the joint appendix under seal filed by petitioners Quanta Computer, Inc., et al.

Nov 5 2007 Supplement to Joint Appendix (Pages 199 to 267)

Nov 12 2007 Brief amicus curiae of International Business Machines Corporation filed.

Nov 12 2007 Brief amici curiae of Consumers Union, et al. filed.

Nov 12 2007 Brief amici curiae of Automotive Engine Rebuilders Association, et al. filed.

Nov 13 2007 Brief amicus curiae of United States filed.

Nov 13 2007 Brief amicus curiae of CropLife International filed.

Nov 13 2007 Brief amicus curiae of Gen-Probe Incorporated filed.

Nov 13 2007 Brief amicus curiae of American Seed Trade Association filed.

Nov 13 2007 Brief amicus curiae of NCR Corporation filed.

Nov 13 2007 Brief amicus curiae of American Antitrust Institute filed.

Nov 13 2007 Brief amicus curiae of Licensing Executives Society in Support of Neither Party filed.

Nov 13 2007 Brief amicus curiae of Biotechnology Industry Organization in Support of Neither Party filed.

Nov 13 2007 Brief amici curiae of Nokia Corporation and Nokia Inc. filed.

Nov 13 2007 Brief amici curiae of Dell Inc., Hewlett-Packard Co., Cisco Systems, Inc. and E-Bay Inc. filed.

Nov 13 2007 Brief amicus curiae of Computer & Communications Industry Association filed.

Nov 13 2007 Letter proposing a LODGING received from counsel for amici Dell, Inc., et al.

Nov 13 2007 Brief amicus curiae of Motorola, Inc. filed.

Nov 14 2007 Motion DISTRIBUTED for Conference of November 30, 2007.

Nov 16 2007 SET FOR ARGUMENT ON Wednesday, January 16, 2008.

Dec 3 2007 Motion for leave to file Volume II of the joint appendix under seal. GRANTED.

Dec 3 2007 Brief of respondent LG Electronics, Inc. filed.

Dec 3 2007 Motion of the Solicitor General for leave to participate in oral argument as amicus curiae and for divided argument filed.

Dec 6 2007 CIRCULATED.

Dec 6 2007 Brief amicus curiae of American Intellectual Property Law Association filed. (Distributed)

Dec 10 2007 Motion of the Solicitor General for leave to participate in oral argument as amicus curiae and for divided argument GRANTED.

Dec 10 2007 Brief amicus curiae of Qualcomm Incorporated filed. (Distributed)

Dec 10 2007 Brief amicus curiae of Papst Licensing GMBH & Co.KG filed. (Distributed).

Dec 10 2007 Brief amicus curiae of Intellectual Property Owners Association filed. (Distributed)

Dec 10 2007 Brief amicus curiae of Wi-LAN, Inc. filed. (Distributed).

Dec 10 2007 Brief amicus curiae of Ibiquity Digital Corporation filed. (Distributed)

Dec 10 2007 Brief amicus curiae of MPEG LA LLC filed. (Distributed)

Dec 10 2007 Brief amici curiae of Interdigital Communications LLC and Tessera, Inc. filed. (Distributed)

Dec 10 2007 Brief amici curiae of Various Law Professors filed. (Distributed)

Dec 10 2007 Brief amicus curiae of Rembrandt IP Management LLC filed. (Distributed)

Dec 10 2007 Brief amicus curiae of Yahoo! Inc. filed. (Distributed)

Dec 10 2007 Brief amicus curiae of AmberWave Systems Corporation filed. (Distributed)

Dec 10 2007 Brief amici curiae of Aerotel, Ltd., Aerotel U.S.A., Inc., and Aerotel U.S.A., LLC filed. (Distributed)

Dec 10 2007 Brief amicus curiae of Technology Properties Limited filed. (Distributed)

Dec 19 2007 Record received from U.S.C.A. for Federal Circuit. (2 boxes)

Dec 26 2007 Record received from U.S.D.C. for the Northern District of California. (11 boxes)

Dec 28 2007 Motion for leave to file reply brief under seal with redacted copies for the public record filed by petitioners Quanta Computer, Inc., et al. (Distributed)

Dec 28 2007 Redacted reply brief of petitioners Quanta Computer, Inc., et al. filed. (Distributed)

Jan 2 2008 Motion DISTRIBUTED for Conference of January 4, 2008.

Jan 7 2008 Motion for leave to file a reply brief under seal with redacted copies for the public record GRANTED.

Jan 11 2008 Letter from counsel for petitioner received. (Distributed)

Jan 16 2008 Argued. For petitioners: Maureen E. Mahoney, Washington, D.C.; and Thomas G. Hungar, Deputy Solicitor General, Department of Justice, Washington, D.C. (for United States, as amicus curiae.) For respondent: Carter G. Phillips, Washington, D.C.

Feb 8 2008 January 15, 2008, letter from counsel for the petitioners filed. (Distributed)

Feb 8 2008 Motion to unseal the reply brief filed by petitioners.

Feb 11 2008 Motion DISTRIBUTED for Conference of February 15, 2008.  
 Feb 19 2008 Motion to unseal the reply brief GRANTED.  
 Jun 9 2008 Judgment REVERSED. Thomas, J., delivered the opinion for a unanimous Court.  
 Jul 11 2008 JUDGMENT ISSUED.  
 Jul 16 2008 Record returned to the U.S.C.A. for the Federal Circuit.  
 Jul 16 2008 Record returned to the U.S.D.C. for the Northern District of California.  
 Jul 22 2008 Acknowledgement of receipt (07/14/08) of judgment from Clerk, United States Court of Appeals for the Federal Circuit received.

---

| ~~Name~~~~~                                                   | ~~~~~Address~~~~~                                                                                           | ~~Phone~~~     |
|---------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------|
| <b>Attorneys for Petitioners:</b>                             |                                                                                                             |                |
| Maureen E. Mahoney<br>Counsel of Record                       | Latham & Watkins LLP<br>555 11th Street, NW<br>Suite 1000<br>Washington, DC 20004<br>Maureen.Mahoney@LW.com | (202) 637-2200 |
| Party name: Quanta Computer, Inc., et al.                     |                                                                                                             |                |
| <b>Attorneys for Respondent:</b>                              |                                                                                                             |                |
| Carter G. Phillips<br>Counsel of Record                       | Sidley Austin LLP<br>1501 K Street, N.W.<br>Washington, DC 20005<br>cphillips@sidley.com                    | (202) 736-8000 |
| Party name: LG Electronics, Inc.                              |                                                                                                             |                |
| Richard G. Taranto                                            | Farr & Taranto<br>1220 19th Street, N.W.<br>Suite 800<br>Washington, DC 20036<br>rgtjd@cs.com               | (202) 775-0184 |
| Party name: LG Electronics, Inc.                              |                                                                                                             |                |
| <b>Other:</b>                                                 |                                                                                                             |                |
| Jonathan Band                                                 | Jonathan Band PLLC<br>21 Dupont Circle NW<br>8th Floor<br>Washington, DC 20036                              | (202) 296-5675 |
| Party name: Computer and Communications Industry Association  |                                                                                                             |                |
| Kenneth C. Bass III                                           | Sterne, Kessler, Goldstein & Fox<br>1100 New York Avenue, NW<br>Washington, DC 20005                        | (202) 772-8825 |
| Party name: Interdigital Communications LLC and Tessera, Inc. |                                                                                                             |                |
| Garrard R. Beeney                                             | Sullivan & Cromwell LLP<br>125 Broad Street                                                                 | (212) 558-4000 |

New York, NY

Party name: MPEG LA LLC

Beth S. Brinkmann

Morrison & Foerster LLP  
2000 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W.  
Washington, DC 20006-1888  
bbrinkmann@mofo.com

(202) 887-1544

Party name: Gen-Probe Incorporated

Morgan Chu

Irell & Manella LLP  
1800 Avenue of the Stars, Suite 900  
Los Angeles, CA 90067

(310) 203-7000

Party name: NCR Corporation

Richard W. Clary

Cravath, Swaine & Moore LLP  
825 Eighth Avenue  
New York, NY 10019-7475

(212) 474-1000

Party name: Qualcomm Incorporated

Roger L. Cook

Townsend and Townsend and Crew LLP  
Two Embarcadero Center  
8th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94111

(415) 576-0200

Party name: Technology Properties Limited

Michael J. Doyle

Ostrager Chong Flaherty & Brottman PC  
570 Lexington Avenue  
New York, NY 10022-6894

(212) 681-0600

Party name: Aerotel, Ltd., Aerotel U.S.A., Inc., and Aerotel U.S.A., LLC

Albert A. Foer

American Antitrust Institute  
o2919 Ellicott St., NW  
Washington, DC 20008

(202) 276-6002

Party name: American Antitrust Institute

Gregory G. Garre

Solicitor General  
United States Department of Justice  
950 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, DC 20530-0001

(202) 514-2217

Party name: United States

Robert E. Goodfriend

McKool Smith PC  
300 Crescent Court  
Suite 1500  
Dallas, TX 75201

(214) 978-4000

Party name: Wi-LAN, Inc.

Seth D. Greenstein                      Constantine Cannon LLP                      (202) 204-3500  
1625 I Street NW  
Washington, DC 20006

Party name: Automotive Engine Rebuilders Association, et al.

Gary M. Hoffman                      Dickstein Shapiro Morin Oshinsky LLP                      (202) 785-9700  
2101 L Street, Suite 400  
Washington, DC 20037-1526

Party name: Intellectual Property Owner Association

Thomas G. Hungar                      Gibson, Dunn & Crutcher LLP                      (202) 955-8500  
1050 Connecticut Ave, NW  
Washington, DC 20036

Party name: Quanta Computer, Inc., et al. v. LG Electronics, Inc.

Song K. Jung                      McKenna Long & Aldridge                      (202) 496-7500  
1900 K Street, N.W.  
Washington, DC 20006

Party name: AmberWave Systems Corporation

F. Scott Kieff                      1111 23rd Street NW                      (202) 558-6667  
Apt. 3d  
Washington, DC 20037

Party name: Various Law Professors

Edwin S. Kneedler                      Acting Solicitor General                      (202) 514-2217  
United States Department of Justice  
950 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, DC 20530-0001

Party name: United States

Gary Jay Kushner                      Hogan & Hartson LLP                      (202) 637-5856  
555 Thirteenth Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20004

Party name: Quanta Computer, Inc., et al. v. LG Electronics, Inc.

Russell E. Levine                      Kirkland & Ellis LLP                      (312) 861-2000  
200 East Randolph Drive  
Chicago, IL 60001

Party name: Motorola, Inc.

Jeffrey I. D. Lewis                      Paterson Belknap Webb & Tyler LLP                      (212) 336-2000  
1133 Avenue of the Americas  
New York, NY 10036

Party name: American Intellectual Property Law Association

Traci L. Lovitt Jones Day (212) 326-3939  
222 East 41st Street  
New York, NY 10017

Party name: International Business Machines Corporation

Joel E. Lutzker Sheppard Mullin Richter & Hampton LLP (212) 332-3800  
30 Rockefeller Plaza, 24th Floor  
New York, NY 10112

Party name: (Minebea Co., Ltd.) & Licensing Executives Society

Roderick R. McKelvie Covington & Burling LLP (202) 662-6000  
1201 Pennsylvania Ave., NW  
Washington, DC 20004

Party name: Ibiquity Digital Corporation

Patricia A. Millett Akin Gump Strauss Hauer & Feld LLP (202) 887-4400  
1333 New Hampshire Ave., NW  
Washington, DC 20036  
pmillett@akingump.com

Party name: Biotechnology Industry Organization

Aaron M. Panner Kellogg, Huber, Hansen, Todd, Evans & Figel, P.L.L.C. (202) 326-7900  
1615 M Street, N.W.  
Suite 400  
Washington, DC 20036

Party name: Rembrandt IP Management LLC

Andrew J. Pincus Mayer Brown LLP (202) 263-3220  
1909 K Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20006-1101  
apincus@mayerbrown.com

Party name: Dell Inc., Hewlett-Packard Co., Cisco Systems, Inc. and E-Bay Inc.

Lawrence Rosenthal Chapman University School of Law (714) 628-2650  
One University Drive  
Orange, CA 92866

Party name: Papst Licensing GMBH & Co.KG

Kathleen M. Sullivan Stanford Constitutional Law Center (650) 725-9875  
Stanford Law School  
559 Nathan Abbott Way  
Stanford, CA 94305-8610

Party name: Nokia Corporation and Nokia Inc.

Fred Von Lohmann Electric Frontier Foundation (415)-436-9333

454 Shotwell Street  
San Francisco, CA 94110

Party name: Consumers Union, et al.

Seth P. Waxman

Wilmer Cutler Pickering Hale and Dorr LLP (202) 663-6000  
1875 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, DC 20006  
seth.waxman@wilmerhale.com

Party name: CropLife International

Christopher J. Wright

Wiltshire & Grannis LLP (202) 730-1300  
1200 Eighteenth St., N.W.  
Washington, DC 20036  
cwright@harriswiltshire.com

Party name: Yahoo! Inc.